



Collective Action in the Development of Urban Farming for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City

Mahyudin¹

Doctoral Student of Public Administration, Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia

Muh. Akmal Ibrahim²

Department of Administrative Science, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia

Muhammad Yunus²

Departments of Administrative Science, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia

Syahrribulan²

Departments of Administrative Science, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia

Didik Iskandar³

Departments of Administrative Science, Makassar State University, Indonesia

Abstract

Efforts to develop urban farming are currently experiencing various obstacles such as increasingly limited agricultural land in urban areas. This study aims to analyze Collective Action in Developing Urban Farming for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City. The research approach used is qualitative, the location of the study was carried out in Makassar City. The informants of this study include the Food Security Service, the Fisheries and Agriculture Service, Agricultural Extension Workers and Women Farmers Groups. The types of data collection are observation, in-depth interviews and documentation studies. Data analysis uses interactive data analysis. The results of the study indicate that the development of urban farming faces various challenges such as limited land, environmental problems, and lack of independence and public awareness requiring strategies that do not only rely on government assistance, but also encourage active community participation in overcoming these problems. Network development is a key element that underlies the success of collective action in this program. The implementation of network regulation is greatly influenced by the implementation of clear and firm rules and standard operating procedures (SOP). The collective action process involves coordination efforts, dissemination of ideas, and implementation of solutions that are actively supported by various parties. Public awareness and community awareness are factors that influence the success of Collective Action in Developing Urban Farming for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City.

Keywords: Collective Action, Urban Farming, Food Resilience



Introduction

The collective action approach in public policy studies first appeared in mid-1965. Olson (1965) was the first figure to start it. In his view, the policy process, both policy formulation and implementation, is the result of inevitable interactions between a plurality of actors with different interests, goals and strategies in an inter-organizational network where a particular public issue/problem is intervened (Kickert; 1999). The actors referred to here are the government (public organization), then interest groups, parties, social groups, the business world (private organizations) and other entities in society as well as the citizens themselves (individuals).

These actors interact with each other according to the relationship and role they play in solving the problem. How big or important the actor's role is depends on the resources they have and how important those resources are in overcoming the public issue or problem. In addition, according to Allison (in Kickert, 1999) it also depends on their ability to carry out action channels such as consultation procedures, agreements, lobbying or bargaining.

Collective Action is a concept that emphasizes that there is a pattern of relationships between actors involved and interdependent on the scope of a particular public problem or affair (Vanni, 2014). It can be said that success in intervening in a particular public problem or affair is highly dependent on the transaction process between actors, which is essentially 'connecting' one actor with another in order to find common ground for opinions, interests and strategies to solve a particular public problem or affair in order to achieve common goals.

With many actors involved in such a network model, complexity and dynamics are naturally very likely to occur in it. This is possible because these actors are in different domains and do not have fixed preferences; these actors have different perceptions and solutions that can change at any time; these actors have different goals, methods, resources, interests and action strategies; and these actors also have different designers (Kickert. et al, 1999). With these conditions, the emergence of certain conflicts and unexpected consequences is also very likely to occur.

The Collective Action approach in policy plays a very important role in the process of solving certain public problems. As in the problem of developing urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City through various programs including programs to increase community food diversification and resilience and community empowerment programs in diversifying food consumption based on local resources.

Other data shows that in supporting the development of sustainable urban farming, in 2023, the number of target groups for this policy will reach 500 groups in Makassar City. Where the budget for community empowerment programs in diversifying food consumption based on local resources in 2023 will reach 16,989,858,800 billion. This shows the political will of the Makassar City government in encouraging the development of urban farming in Makassar City.

The collective action approach is a concept that combines various policy tools, not standing alone (Vanni, 2014). This means that the urban farming development policy for sustainable food independence in Makassar City cannot be maximized by the local government alone as the leading sector, but requires the involvement of other stakeholders who are considered to be able to contribute in a network organization container so as to increase the effectiveness of the policy.

The implementation of urban farming policies in the framework of sustainable food independence in Makassar City has so far faced various problems and challenges. The problems faced include, limited land that can be used for crop cultivation activities; Lack of community interest and participation in crop cultivation due to the heterogeneous background of urban communities; The limited number of technical assistants/extensions related to crop cultivation compared to the number of groups being fostered in Makassar City.



As well as the need for additional socialization activities to the community related to insight into food consumption diversification (B2SA food patterns), utilization of production results to have economic value, and family food security. According to Carlsson (2000) Collective Action is an idea about the relationship between network members based on resource interdependence: each actor wants something from one or more other actors and is ready to exchange something of their own to get it. Meanwhile, the Collective Action approach is considered important in solving complex public problems.

Furthermore, collective action in the perspective of policy networks is a study that focuses on the collective use of resources by stakeholders. Where the use of resources collectively shows the effectiveness and efficiency of the performance of a policy (Carlsson, 2000). According to Ostrom (2004) that collective action in policy is a group of actors or organizations that are interconnected due to resource dependency through collective action. The presence of policy network studies in answering complex problems thus various interests of actors will be easily organized and accommodated in the implementation of a policy.

The theory of collective action is based on the assumption that the relationship between actors in an organization is interdependent with each other or commonly called interdependence (Meizen-Dick, et.al, 2004). In the sense that, each actor in an organization cannot achieve organizational goals without utilizing the resources of other actors or depending on the resources of other actors or organizations.

The existence of collective action is a form of cooperation between actors in the formulation and implementation of public policy. Observing from the previous opinion that this shows the existence of an interaction process that occurs between individual actors, groups, community organizations, semi-public, and or private sectors that have the ability to act autonomously to participate in the interaction process. This is due to the dependence of resources between these actors. The existence of inter-organizational networks in the policy implementation process has many benefits.

This study has differences with previous studies that have been conducted previously. Where this study analyzes the phenomenon of urban farming policy in realizing sustainable food independence through a collective action approach. Joint action (collective) is an action taken and agreed upon by a group that aims at common interests because it has the same hopes and goals to be achieved by the group (Carlsson, 2000). In the collective action process, stakeholders in making policies that will be implemented certainly have the same hopes and goals so that joint action needs to be taken.

The collective action approach offers important elements in policy studies including framing contests, network building, institutional arrangements and collective action processes that encourage policy effectiveness (Hargrave & Van De Ven (2006). Hargrave & Van De Ven (2006) explain further the elements of collective action which include: a) Framing contests draw attention to the creation and manipulation of issue meaning. Framing contests are observed at two levels. The first relates to the fundamental basis for the solution development process and the second relates to the solutions proposed as a result of the development process. b) Construction of networks is the second important issue that plays a key role in the process of institutional innovation change, as it refers to the mobilization of resources to initiate collective action.

The involvement of operational actor networks is as important as ensuring top-level political support and commitment. c) Enactment of institutional arrangements One of the main concepts referred to when they talk about the enactment of institutional arrangements is political opportunism. Political opportunity structures can be seen as formal and informal political conditions that encourage, discourage, or in any way influence the activities of the Movement within the framework of the proposed solution. d) Collective action process as a political



process contested through emerging new technologies. How actor networks are involved, the efforts of actors, the dissemination of ideas by actors, providing regular feedback to the organization on how the proposed solution can bring benefits.

Based on the initial findings of the study, the following are several issues that have developed in relation to urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City when viewed from a collective action approach. First, the problem of framing contest is related to the developing issue and urban farming strategy in Makassar City. The problem findings show that the developing issue in Makassar City is the limited land that can be used for agriculture. Most of the land has been used for the development of urban infrastructure. Then the issue of the problem transportation and accessibility to markets and consumers.

In addition, the issue of access to clean water for irrigation and plant needs is a key issue in urban farming. Another issue is the skills gained from training and education on these techniques are important for the success of urban farming. Then another issue is soil contamination by industrial pollution or domestic waste, communities need to have access to quality seeds, fertilizers, and agricultural equipment. Another issue is that urban farming must comply with food safety standards and ensure the quality of the products produced. Monitoring and testing of agricultural products are important to maintain public health. Urban farming produces organic waste.

Problems related to network development show that the Makassar City Government through the Food Security Agency has not been able to embrace and empower all stakeholders related to urban farming development. Although involving stakeholders such as private companies, academics to environmental organizations, their involvement is not effective and is only limited to the policy level but not to its implementation. In addition, network development is not supported by the availability of adequate resources such as limited human resources, budget and agricultural technology equipment.

Problem The implementation of institutional arrangements shows initial findings that the development of urban farming in Makassar City through the leading sector of the Food Security Service has not provided clear rules and technical instructions in carrying out collective action with other stakeholders. This causes the government to tend to work alone and makes other stakeholders such as private companies, environmental organizations, academics and NGOs unable to be maximally involved because there are no clear rules, duties and responsibilities for them.

The problem regarding the collective action process shows a problem, namely the absence of clear rules of the game, such as the division of tasks and responsibilities to stakeholders. such as private companies, environmental organizations, academics to NGOs, causing a lack of collective action processes carried out together with the government. Whereas the collective action approach emphasizes the participation and synergy of various stakeholders in implementing policies. Various problems faced in the development of urban farming as described above can be solved with a collective action approach that integrates all stakeholders in encouraging better policy effectiveness. Where collective action is a new approach in analyzing policy phenomena.

Research Methodology

The qualitative approach used in this study is based on a number of concepts and theories related to Collective Action that have been widely developed. Then reduced into a number of research questions, research focuses and conceptual frameworks. The selection of a qualitative approach in the phenomenon of urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City through the Lorong Wisata program aims to explain the phenomenon holistically and in accordance with its context. This research was conducted in Makassar City as one of the largest cities in Eastern Indonesia that implements urban farming policies. Data



collection for this research was carried out for 3 months, namely September-December in 2024.

In this study, the informants of the study were actors involved in the Collective Action process in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. Where the researcher determined key informants based on the information obtained including stakeholders directly involved in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. The data collection techniques used were through observation, interviews (deep interviews), and documentation. In this study, the researcher chose several data collection techniques, namely behavioral observation of actors involved in collective action in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. This observation was used by utilizing field notes containing notes on collective action in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. In-depth interviews were conducted with actors or stakeholders involved and contributing to the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City as reviewed from the theory of collective action. The interview process was carried out by asking various questions arranged in the format of interview guidelines, where the questions were related to the six dimensions of collective action theory. In the documentation study process, the researcher obtained quantitative data such as statistical data, documents in the form of RPMJD, Renstra and reports on the implementation of agricultural programs related to the phenomenon of urban farming development policies for sustainable food independence in Makassar City.

Analysis and Result

Makassar City Urban Farming Policy Through the Tourism Corridor Program

Urban farming or urban agriculture is an activity of cultivating plants by involving skills, expertise and innovation in cultivating food processing for the community through the utilization of yards, empty lands to increase nutrition and improve the economy and family welfare to form a farming group. Urban farming or urban agriculture with the characteristic of having low environmental quality and narrow land but on the other hand has promising economic potential if managed properly. In addition, urban agriculture has benefits to improve the ecology in the area. The presence of agriculture in urban areas and areas around urban areas provides positive value not only in meeting food needs but also there are practical values that can have an impact on the sustainability of the ecology and economy of urban areas. The state of agriculture in urban communities can be used as a suggestion to optimize the use of land and natural resources in the city by using the agricultural facilities and infrastructure that have been provided.

Urban farming become one of the tourism alley programs in the city of Makassar. Through the tourism alley, the urban farming program is intended to provide food needs for families in the alley. The tourism alley is one of the strategic programs of the Mayor of Makassar. The Tourism Alley is one of the efforts to improve the economy of Makassar City. Arranging and beautifying the alley is combined with attractive colors. But not only that, through the tourism alley also encourages food independence in the alley by involving housewives to be active in land utilization through farming in the alley. The implementation of the Tourism Alley program is based on the Makassar Mayor Regulation Number 37 of 2021 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of the Garden Alley Improvement Program and the Fulfillment of Five Thousand Tourism Alleys. However, it has not been able to accommodate the existing needs and developments.

So that special regulations were made for tourism alleys which became the basis for the implementation of tourism alleys, namely the Makassar Mayor Regulation Number 94 of 2022 concerning the Establishment of Tourism Alleys. With the purpose of Article 3 explained that to carry out mapping and clustering of potential alleys based on information technology, based on the potential of alleys in determining Tourism Alleys related to human resource potential,



physical environmental potential and economic development potential; develop alley economic activities based on green gardens, culinary and crafts; and provide facilities and infrastructure to develop the alley economy based on the potential it has.

Framing Contests in Urban Farming Development for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City

Framing contest is very relevant to use in the context of urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. This is because urban farming is a very important issue in forming food security in urban areas. Framing contest can form a strategy based on the issues of the problems faced. Framing contests observed through two levels, namely those related to the fundamental basis for the solution development process and the second related to the solutions proposed as a result of the development process. Framing contests, show the importance of strategy making in situations of uncertainty.

Based on field findings, it shows that in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, in the implementation of urban farming there are various issues that occur. In the implementation of urban farming in Makassar City, limited land in the development of urban farming is often the main problem faced in the formation of agriculture in Makassar City. The limited land that occurs is indicated by the existing conditions of small alleys and the many community activities. This also affects the sustainability of urban farming in each alley that has been formed, the sustainability of urban farming development is influenced by the absence of a container formed to bridge women's farmer groups or farmer groups in terms of marketing their agricultural products. There needs to be training in terms of packaging agricultural products to attract retailers to want to cooperate with women's farmer groups.

Not only that, the high carbon emissions in urban areas are often a problem for the sustainability of yard land use, especially in Makassar City. This is what affects the development of plants in the urban farming program. Other issues faced in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City are very limited assistance and agricultural extension workers, these limitations affect the assistance for women's farmer groups (groups that play a role in the development of urban farming in each alley that has been formed). Because the limited agricultural extension workers also have an impact on the lack of focus of women's farmer groups in carrying out agricultural activities in their yards. Another issue in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City is the mindset of the community who always expect assistance from the government, so this also affects the sustainability of urban farming.

The problem issues faced in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City are the lack of understanding and productivity of people in certain locations who have other activities, so they are not so focused on plant development. The effects of very high pollution affect plant growth, as well as the location of the alley which is very narrow with many community activities in the alley so that the lack of sunlight also affects the growth and development of plants. This is what affects the productivity and sustainability of the implementation of urban agriculture. Then, related to the mindset of the community who still expect continuous assistance from the government. This is what causes the lack of community independence in processing and developing agricultural products from the stimulus assistance provided. So that some agricultural products only stop at meeting household needs.

Another problem faced is the absence of a forum to regulate and bridge the harvest produced by several groups of women farmers, so that cooperative relationships with modern retailers have stopped due to the inability to meet demand. In addition, other factors that also affect are plant pests and diseases and weather factors that affect plant growth and development. In the



framing contest, a strategy is needed to overcome the issues faced. In overcoming the problems faced in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, the strategy formed is to overcome the limited land in each alley, so agriculture is formed using hydroponic, vertical and polybag methods.

With this planting method, it can help utilize narrow land for the development of plant growth in the alley. In overcoming carbon emissions and limited land that affect plant growth, provide assistance interventions by adjusting the existing conditions of the alley. Increase the capacity of extension workers in assisting women's farmer groups in the alley. Encourage the independence of women's farmer groups in the development of urban farming so that sustainable urban agriculture is created in each alley that has been formed. Then, related to agricultural processing results, an active role is needed in providing packing and marketing facilities for agricultural products produced by women's farmer groups.

Construction of Networks in Urban Farming Development for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City

Construction of networks is the second important issue that plays a key role in the process of institutional innovation change, as it refers to the mobilization of resources to initiate collective action. The involvement of operational actor networks is as important as ensuring top-level political support and commitment. Network building in collective action can be done by building alliances and networks to enable collaboration, cooperation, knowledge sharing. Network building can assist in partnerships to create a strong force for change. In the implementation of urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, network development is needed to assist in the development of urban farming.

The development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City which is packaged in the strategic program of the mayor of Makassar, namely through the Tourism Alley, its implementation involves stakeholders from various Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD). Stakeholders who are the leading sectors in the development of urban farming are the Food Security Service which collaborates with the Fisheries and Agriculture Service which plays a role in providing seeds and also mentoring by extension workers. The Cooperatives and SMEs Service plays a role in providing training and mentoring for packaging and providing facilities to assist in marketing processed products from women's farmer groups in the alley.

Mobilization of resources in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City is related to the budget in this case the provision of facilities and production such as the provision of seed assistance and planting media for the development of agriculture in the alley. Then on the quality of resources, namely the provision of assistance to the Women Farmers Group through agricultural extension workers. In packaging and marketing products are provided through training from the Cooperatives and SMEs Service.

In Network Development, public awareness and Community awareness are very much needed in the development of Urban Farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, that the role of stakeholders does not stop when the formation, provision of assistance, and training have been implemented. This is indicated by the lack of community interest in continuing crop cultivation activities after the first harvest period is carried out. So that not only public awareness needs to be increased but it is also important to foster stakeholder awareness in encouraging the community to be involved in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence.

Enactment of Institutional Arrangements in the Development of Urban Farming for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City

Enactment of institutional arrangements One of the main concepts referred to when they talk



about the enactment of institutional arrangements is political opportunism. Political opportunity structures can be seen as the formal and informal political conditions that encourage, discourage, or in some way influence the activities of the Movement within the framework of the solutions offered. In implementing the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, there needs to be a regulatory basis that regulates the implementation and standard operating procedures in terms of mentoring and providing assistance to beneficiaries in this case the Women Farmers Group.

Field findings show that in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, there are several rules and standard operating procedures (SOPs), including Law Number 18 of 2012 concerning Food, Law Number 22 of 2019 concerning Sustainable Agricultural Cultivation Systems, Law Number 22 of 2009 concerning Diversification of Food Consumption Based on Local Resources, Law Number 16 of 2006 concerning the Agricultural, Fisheries and Forestry Extension System, Government Regulation Number 43 of 2009 concerning Financing, Guidance and Supervision of Agricultural, Fisheries and Forestry Extension, Regulation of the Minister of Agriculture Number 67/Permentan/SM.050/12/2016 of 2016 concerning Fostering of Farmer Institutions, Regulation of the Mayor of Makassar Number 94 of 2022 concerning the Establishment of Tourism Corridors; As well as the Decree on the Establishment of the Women Farmers Group, the Decree on Beneficiaries (signed by the Mayor) which was given to the Women Farmers Group.

The findings of the research results show that in the implementation of urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, there are various legal products, regulations and standard operating procedures in its implementation. In the implementation of network regulation, public awareness and community awareness are very necessary in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, that the importance of stakeholder understanding and awareness related to the rules or policies in the implementation of urban farming in Makassar City, so that the programs created and implemented are right on target to provide benefits, the programs are implemented according to plan and can meet the needs and desires of the community.

Collective Action Process in Urban Farming Development for Sustainable Food Independence in Makassar City

Collective action process as a political process contested through emerging new technologies. how actor networks are involved, efforts of actors, dissemination of ideas by actors, providing regular feedback to the organization on how proposed solutions can bring benefits. In the context of developing urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, the collective action process is related to joint activities carried out by stakeholders in developing urban farming. The activities referred to in developing urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City are in terms of planning, implementation carried out by involving all elements, not only government but also non-government.

The collective action process in developing urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City is carried out through cooperation in the tourist alley carried out with other stakeholders. The Tourist Alley is a strategic program from the Mayor of Makassar, in which there are 16 (sixteen) potential tourist alleys that must be achieved. Of the 16 (sixteen) potentials, there is the potential for increasing plant cultivation. This increase in plant cultivation is then developed into urban farming which is then formed by a women's farmer group (KWT) in the tourist alley. From the formation of this tourist alley, it then encourages the participation of stakeholders to be active in developing urban farming in Makassar City.

The findings of the study indicate that in the process of collective action in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, it is demonstrated through



cooperation in the tourism alley program. The tourism alley is one of the containers for implementing urban farming in Makassar City. In the process of collective action in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City, technical SKPDs can be present in the midst of the community to see the program and conditions directly. So that the cooperation that is formed will be stronger and can help in the sustainability of the urban farming program. Through the active role of each stakeholder to be present and see the conditions and needs required in improving and sustaining urban farming, it can encourage NGOs to participate in encouraging and supporting the urban farming program in Makassar City.

The process of collective action, public awareness and community awareness is very necessary in this case to build cooperation in the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City. If the community is aware of the importance of developing urban farming, then problems related to food security can be resolved together. Then, not only public awareness is needed in building cooperation, but the awareness of each stakeholder is very important to increase transparency, accountability and quality of service in this case the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City.

Findings and Conclusion

The Framing Contest on the development of urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City faces issues such as limited land, environmental problems, and lack of independence and public awareness. The strategies implemented by the Makassar City Government include planting hydroponic media, vertical culture and polybags, then intervention assistance according to existing conditions, encouraging the independence of Women Farmers Groups and increasing the capacity of extension workers.

Network development in urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City is a key element underlying the success of collective action in this program. The government as the leading sector does not encourage cooperation between agencies, women's farmer groups, and the community. In addition, the mobilization of budget resources, training, and technical knowledge to support urban farming development is limited. The implementation of network arrangements in the context of urban farming development for sustainable food independence in Makassar City has rules and standard operating procedures (SOPs) in its implementation. However, this is not enough, Lorong Wisata should have regional regulations and technical instructions that explain concretely what the indicators of success and the form of program evaluation are.

The collective action process in developing urban farming for sustainable food independence in Makassar City is carried out through coordination, dissemination of ideas, and implementation of solutions that are actively supported by various actors. Through various collaborations in the Lorong Wisata program, an effective collective action network has been created, which not only focuses on urban farming, but also on community-based economic development and sustainability. However, it is expected that regular feedback, clear quality standards, and comprehensive evaluations will be carried out by the government by involving various actors.

Reference

- Carlsson. L. 2000. Policy Network as Collective Action. *Policies Study Journal*. 28(3), 502-520
- Hargrave, TJ, & Van de Ven, AH 2006. A collective action model of institutional innovation. *Academy of management review*, 31(4), 864-888
- Kickert, Walter JM, EH Klijin and Joop FM Koppenjan. 1999, *Managing Complex Networks : Strategies for the Public Sector*, Sage Publications, London



- Meinzen-Dick et al. 2004. *Indicate That Collective Action Should Be Voluntary And Requires The Involvement*. London: The Pharmaceutical Press
- Olson, M. 1995. *The Logic of Collective Action*. Cambridge: MA: Harvard Univ. Press
- Ostrom E. 2001. Collective Action, Property Rights, And Decentralization In Resource Use In India And Nepal. *Politics and Society* 29 (4):485- 514.
- Vanni Francesco. 2014. *Agriculture and Public Goods, The Role of Collective Action*, London-New York: Springer